

Office of the Director  
50 W. Gay St.  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040  
(614) 645-8591  
(614) 645-6245 (FAX)

Planning Division  
50 W. Gay St.  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040  
(614) 645-8664  
(614) 645-1483 (FAX)

Downtown Commission  
Daniel J. Thomas (Staff)  
Urban Design Manager  
(614) 645-8404  
djthomas@columbus.gov

## **DOWNTOWN COMMISSION RESULTS**

**Tuesday, May 27, 2014**

**50 W. Gay Street, (Beacon Building) Conference Room B – 1<sup>st</sup> Floor**

### **I. Attendance**

Present: Steve Wittmann (Chair), Otto Beatty, Jr. (Vice chair), Tedd Hardesty, Mike Lusk, Jana Maniace, Danni Palmore

Absent: Michael Brown, Kyle Katz, Robert Loversidge

City Staff: Daniel Thomas, Elizabeth Brown, Kevin Wheeler

### **II. Approval of the April 22, 2014 Downtown Commission Meeting Results**

Move to approve (6-0)

### **III. Conceptual and / or Informational Review**

#### **Case#1 801-14**

##### **Goodale Street north of Convention Center**

**Applicant:** NBBJ David Brehm

**Property Owner:** Franklin County Convention Facilities Authority

##### **Request:**

Conceptual review of a structured parking garage north of the Convention Center

##### **Discussion**

Bill Jennison, Franklin County Convention Facilities Authority, currently there is a 200 space surface parking lot north of the convention center. The new structured parking would have 800 or so vehicles. The garage would be sited as far to the east as possible, in order to leave some developable land closer to High St. There could be a 300 to 500 room convention hotel, but that is premature. Immediate plans are to renovate the existing convention center, which is 20 years old. Some exterior work will be done as well. Expanding the convention center to the north is a third option. Goodale Street would have a new, fancy façade.

Dave Brehm, NBBJ. Garage fulfills needs for convention center but also for the Short North. Architectural modeling was shown. The entrance to the garage and cueing was strategically placed. The roof of the garage would be used for events. Ramps will be confined to the eastern side. There are great views of downtown from the top of the garage. The open garage roofs would be about 96 feet from the ground.

Some elements of the convention center have been translated to the parking garage. There will be vertical louvers on the side of the garage, allowing light into the garage. JM – could the louvers be used as a sculptural form –A. It is in progress and does have budgetary constraints. Louvered material are being explored. The west side will interface with development. Bridge over to the convention center. A. That is being thought about, pedestrian on grade connection is not desirable. TH – Bridge and safety are an issue. A. Approval in June.

#### **Result**

Conceptual review only.

#### **Case #2 802-14**

**Address:** City of Columbus, R.O.W.

**Applicant:** Central Ohio Transit Authority (COTA)

**Design Professional:** COTA Staff and consultants

#### **Request**

Conceptual Review – Informational Presentation on Bus Rapid Transit downtown.:

#### **Discussion**

Bus Rapid Transit was for downtown presented. Federal funds are being sought. The initial route will go down primarily down Cleveland Ave. all the way down to Africa Rd. Pylon markers were shown. Real time information will be show. Environmental studies are being done. New stations are being installed. There will be about 16 pylon stations in downtown. Pylons will relate to the new stations. Pylons are about 17 feet in height. There might be a ticking machine as part of the pylon. The pylons might have canopies. Branding strategy is being going through. Lighting as it relates to the station, and street lights is being looked at. The material of the pylon and new station will coordinate. Canopy presence relates to proximity of stations.

Transparency is important. ML – opportunity for emergency levers. A. We have considered that. There will be \$400,000 related to art. General appreciation from the Commission.

### **V.Review for Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition**

#### **Case #3 803 -14**

**Address:** 555 W. Nationwide Blvd.

**Applicant:** Gary Prenger CH2M Hill

**Property Owner:** City of Columbus, Department of Public Utilities

**Request** CC3359.23

Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of 555 W. Nationwide Blvd., part of the City of Columbus Dublin Ave. power complex.

Demolition of existing garage. This is required so that the Division of Power can install new electrical switchgear. The switchgear is necessary so that all circuits now in the old power plant can be removed prior to the city selling the old power plant

## **Discussion**

Tom Johansen, Administrator of the Division of Power; the building has been abandoned. The space is needed to bring in a new switchgear – a prefabricated building with electrical equipment. The substation will stay. That is where the primary power is coming in. It would take a lot of dollars to move it somewhere else. OB – couldn't it be screened? A. – They are quite tall, I don't know if they could be totally screened. SW – maybe 10 ft. tall fence. Could the switchgear be screened? A. We had not planned on screening. ML – Is there any reason the new equipment couldn't go into the existing building? A. – Too big to get to it and a significant amount of buried conduit. There are long approaches. Soils are bad as well. FMSA report talks of demolition. The light plant itself has an RFP out for saving. SW – it seems as if you don't really need to demolish the whole building. A. – new conduits are necessary. There will be new fence. There are flood plain issues. A 4 ft. platform will stick out. SW = is there any reason why some landscaping couldn't be done. TH – Coordinate with RFP developer. A – We would be ready to cooperate. Public Services will be doing Nationwide Blvd. OB – reference to staff's photo – (1<sup>st</sup> Ave.) Example of what could be done. SW - Two things – request for demolition and what you are going to do. Grant the demolition. When you come back show what you are going to do and have it look presentable. Wouldn't like to see all chain link fence, right to the edge of the property with gravel. TH – Screening ground mounted equipment are part of the guidelines. SW – don't worry about having the fence too tall. Go ahead and proceed with the demolition. Come back with details of the site plan. We could meet with you ahead of time. A. That's agreeable. ML – Move to approve.

Brad De Hays, one of the developers doing the RFP. No issues with the demolition, but some concerns with potential site placement of new switchgear box in relationship to access of Spring Street. The mid-20<sup>th</sup> Century building also has historic and developmental value. Access is an issue with this. The Nationwide development access could also be affected. The nature of Public Utilities Service trucks and lots is also an issue. Coordination needs to take place. A. The demo contract has already been awarded. There will be two others – building the switchbox and the site work. Bids were taken last week. SW – Your site will have to show fencing and landscaping, materials on the fencing. A. – I don't know if we really have that much opportunities to move the building on site because of the conduit approached. The underground work is most expensive part. Defining the space for the RFP and the operation of the substation is an issue. The RFP will be decided within the next two weeks.

## **Result**

Move for demolition (6-0). The applicant will come back for site plan approval and will indicate such items as fencing location and design and landscaping.

## **VI. Review for Certificate of Appropriateness**

### **Case #4 769-14**

**Address:** 381 East Main Street

**Applicant:** Rick Sicker c/o SiteSource Consultants

**Property Owner:** David Warren c/o McDonald's USA, LLC

**Design Professional:** Frank Shepherd c/o Williams Shepherd Architects, Inc.

**Request** CC3359.05(C)1)

Certificate of Appropriateness review for alteration of existing McDonald's Restaurant.

*The Downtown Commission heard this case this February; results are presented on the subsequent page. In general, the Commission favorably regarded the new McDonald's look but had issues with landscaping,*

### **Discussion**

Handicapped spaces have been moved and will now have concrete pads. A patio has been added, The applicant went over site lighting, landscaping. A border edge was added along E. Main St.. TH – one question – was consideration given to having something more woody to reinforce the tall grass. A. No. ML – Discussion about the sign. A lower level sign would be more appropriate. The sign at Fishinger was the original. We typically do not redo the signs. The franchisee would have to redo. The sign made code then it was installed. Other locations were shown. DP- Could you do a sign similar to the ones at Cleveland and / or Cassidy? A. – could be verified. JM – Looks like you have renovated the building but not the sign. A. – signs are expensive items. OB – how much leverage do you have with a national corporation? I would hate to see us hold up the renovation. TH – could you do a single row of ornamental grass backed up by a row of hedge? Something more permanent. I make a motion to add this.

### **Result**

Motion to approve with the condition of adding a row of hedges in addition to the ornamental grass along Main Street. (5-0)

### **Case #5 804 -14**

**Address:** 121 S. High Street

**Lazarus Building**

**Applicant:** SignCom

**Property Owner:** Columbus Downtown Development Corporation

**Design Professional:** M & A Architects      Damis Building Co.

### **Request** CC3359.05(C)1)

Certificate of Appropriateness for the modification of the eastern façade of the Lazarus Building:

- Conversion of 5 blue awnings to gold / yellow with brown stripes. There are currently 15 blue awnings along the eastern façade.
- At the entrance to the Chintz, replace awning with half round canopy. Include "The Chintz Room" on the face of the canopy.
- Erect blade sign between the third and fourth bays.
- Lighting
- New doors to accommodate the functioning of the restaurant

### **Discussion**

There is a slight modification to the awnings, There will be a 4,000 square foot restaurant. The logo hasn't been entirely worked out but it will be Art Deco. The awnings will have wider stripes. The signs will be internally illuminated. It will open in August.

### **Result**

Motion to approve. (5-0)

**Case #6 805 -14****Address: 240 Nationwide Boulevard****Applicant:** NADA Columbus LLC**Property Owner:** NWD 240 Nationwide LLC c/o Nationwide Realty Investors**Design Professional:** Ron Novak**Request** CC3359.05(C)1)

Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the modification of the eastern ground floor portion of 240 Nationwide Blvd. to accommodate a new restaurant, NADA. Major aspects of this modification are:

- Removal of the large metal awning over the patio. This will be replaced a more open trellis at the northern end.
- Changes to the patio wall / railing
- Extending first floor entrance / recess out and altering its design motif
- Altering the first floor façade at the east end of 240 Nationwide Blvd. to reflect the NADA motif. Changes will be reversible.

**Discussion**

NADA in Cincinnati was shown, a modern Mexican restaurant. The same kind of design motif is sought. Red wood and corten overlay will occur. There will be new single hung windows for the cantina section. All of the material will be removable. The paving and the patio will be all new. The fascia, which is aluminum, will also have a rusted appearance. The vestibule is new, it will float independent of the 240 building. ML – I really like the contrast, DP – it could use it. TH – I commend Nationwide. A – I point out the trellis, which also floats and articulates a dining pavilion – a patterned cement tile will also define this area. There will be a chandelier near the corner. This would also be removable. Timeline – to open in November or December.

**Result**

Motion to approve. (5-0)

**Case #7 806 -14****Address: 260 S. Fourth Street****Stoddart Block****Applicant:** Brad DeHays**Property Owner:** Stoddart Block, LP**Design Professional:** Sandvick Architects, Inc. Contact: Tim Wagner**Request** CC3359.05(C)1)

Certificate of Appropriateness for the renovation of the Stoddart Block, a five story brick residential / retail building. In addition to interior work, major exterior work includes:

- Window replacement.
- New storefront

*New owners of the Stoddard Block use Historic and Tax credits on this project. The Stoddard Block, built in 1911, and the adjacent original Zettlers Hardware, are both listed on the National Register of Historic Places.*

**Discussion**

The entity was purchased off of Homeport in May of 2013. There were issues with conditions. Tenants were not displaced. Restrictive covenants were removed. There are 52 units, 37 were occupied. Since when the building was purchased an additional 12 have moved out.

Micro apartments on floors 1, 2 and 5 are being renovated – HVAC, bathrooms and kitchens – high end finishes. Very minimal studio apartments priced affordably. Micro apartments are like efficiencies. Micro is less than 300 sf. This is not a low income product, it is specifically designed for people who want to be downtown to enjoy the restaurants, parks and entertainment. Downtown workforce can afford and not have to commute. Rent will start out at \$795. This is an adaptive reuse of the existing building – the floor plan will not change.

Exterior renovations replace all of the windows, (wood) federal and state historic tax credits are being pursued. This was originally a furniture store that was turned into housing a while back (1930's). The store front will be replaced. There will be a small transom window line above the awning. And bottle glass tile above the opening. There will be a black vinyl awning. Signage will come back when a tenant is identified. There is a conservation easement with Ohio Heritage. Eventually all units will be renovated.

**Result**

Motion to approve. (5-0)

**Case #8 807 -14**

**Address:** 36 W. Gay Street

**Applicant:** Sara Purcell and John Reagan

**Property Owner:** Mohawk Properties

**Design Professionals:** Sara Purcell and John Reagan

**Request** CC3359.05(C)1)

Certificate of Appropriateness to resume renovation of 36 W. Gay Street. Specifically :

- Existing storefront to be removed on the south and partial east elevation and replaced with a new wood and insulated glass storefront.
- New awning at south elevation ; signage details and color to follow.
- Existing metal awning at Wall Street elevation is to be extended to cover the east lobby entrance door.

**Discussion**

The existing storefront will be removed. The new storefront will be brought out to near the property line. There will be a recess at the single entrance for a single retail space. The lower portion of the storefront would be painted wood, with glass above. A single awning is proposed. Signage will come back when a tenant is identified. No details are provided on the awning, other than occupying the middle third of the storefront and having a simple metal arch. The awning will be the tenant's decision and they will come back. The canopy on the side would be extended over the side door (leading to the lobby for 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> floor) and painted.

**Result**

Move to approve. Will come back for signage approval. (5-0)

**Case #9 808 -14**

**Address:** 114 N. High Street / 5 E. Long Street

**Applicant:** All Star Sign Company Paul Carroll

**Property Owner:** Leatherbuck LLC

**Design Professional:** All Star Sign Company

**Request** CC3359.05(C)1)

Certificate of Appropriateness for perpendicular (blade) sign at the southeast corner of High Street and Long Street.

**Discussion**

One blade sign at a 45 degree angle is proposed. The sign is sized to fit the building. Visibility is desired from both Long and High. The sign will be through bolted into the building and can withstand wind. It could be taken out and be severable. Colors are designed to complement details. ML – would a little more flair be desirable? It looks a little flat. Take a look. I like the sign.

**Result**

Move for approval. (5-0)

**VII. Request for Certificate of Appropriateness for Advertising Mural (Temporary Graphic)**

**Case #10 809-14 and 11**

**Honda Fit ad mural**

**154 N. Third Street**

**Applicant:** CBS Outdoor

**Property Owner:** Schottenstein Property Group

**Request:**

Design review and approval for installation of a vinyl mesh advertising mural to be located on the south elevation of 154 N. Third St. Proposed mural is for Lindsay Honda Fit. This would be an inaugural installation of an ad mural on the south façade (the north façade has had numerous murals). CC3359.07(D).

**Dimensions of mural:** 34'H x 95'W Two dimensional, non lit

**Term of installation:** Seeking approval from. June 2 through November 10, 2014.

**Area of mural:** 3230sf

**Approximate % of area that is text:** 19.2%

**Discussion**

There were some revisions to the ad mural – the ap was removed. TH – we're at 19% text. It's well over what I'm comfortable with. It would have to go a long way in so far with the art piece – the first thing I see is the car. A. –Shared this with client. Was aware of 5% rule. Are you not comfortable with the car? TH – I know he is selling cars. We sometimes diminish the size of items. I'm looking for a more creative way. OB – looks busy. JM – more sky, reduce text, make

the artistic part more prominent. Composition to look like more of a creative piece. Cartoon or painting? OB – would you like to take a shot at revising? DP - there's a lot of different fonts going on. The one that stands out the most is I-70 at Brice. It doesn't fit. TH – 95% art – 5% text. JM – “Lindsay” and “Fit” too large. A. – the campaign starts in the next few weeks. Could resubmission be made electronically? OB – from the comments I've heard, you're a long ways from the 5% rule. I would think you would have to come back. A. The Honda Fit model is coming out this summer. TH - if we were really close maybe it could go to subcommittee, but we are a ways off. ML – Our Design Guidelines are pretty clear on the amount of text.

**Result**

Tabled (5-0)

**Case #11 810-14**

**Lindsay Acura ad mural**

**123 E. Spring Street**

**Applicant:** CBS Outdoor

**Property Owner:** Spring Street LLC

**Request:**

Design review and approval for installation of a vinyl mesh advertising mural to be located on the east elevation of 123 E. Spring St. Proposed mural is for Lindsay Acrua. The Downtown Commission approved a Captain Morgan ad mural in February 2014. CC3359.07(D).

**Dimensions of mural:** 15'H x 35'W Two dimensional, non lit

**Term of installation:** Seeking approval from. June 2 through November 10, 2014.

**Area of mural:** 525sf

**Approximate % of area that is text:** 20%

**Discussion**

Very similar to prior case.

**Result**

Motion to table (5-0)

**Case #12 811-14**

**Ohio Lotto ad mural**

**Address:** 110 N. Third Street

**Applicant:** Orange Barrel Media

**Property Owner:** Exchange Urban Lofts Condominium Association

**Design Professional:** Orange Barrel Media

**Request:**

Design review and approval for installation of a vinyl mesh advertising mural to be located on the north elevation of 110 N. Third Street. Proposed mural – Ohio Lotto “Scratch Big, Win Big”. There have been numerous murals at this location, the latest being for Jaegerbonds. CC3359.07(D)



**Dimensions of mural:** 26'W x 82'H, three dimensional, non lit

**Term of installation:** Seeking approval from June 10 through August 15, 2014

**Area of mural:** 2,132 sf

**Approximate % of area that is text:** 4%

**Discussion**

This is the 40<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Ohio Lotto. The paper clip is meant to be eye catching. What does it mean? We are clearly less than 5%. What do we have to scratch it off with? The paper clip is two dimensional. JM - I think it is very effective, but I always have problems with this site – it is a prominent secondary façade, it competes too much with the architecture. A. We appreciate your consistency. ML – this does bring color and life. DP – this is strong and fun.

**Result**

Motion to approve (4-1) Maniace

**Case #13 812-14**

**FMMF (Fashion Meets Music Festival) ad mural**

**330 Huntington Park Lane– North elevation of Left Field Bleacher Building**

**Applicant:** Ken Schnack, President, Columbus Clippers

**Property Owner:** Franklin County Board of Commissioners

**Design Professional:** DaNite Sign Co.

**Request:**

Design review and approval for installation of a heat transfer advertising mural to be located on the north elevation of the left field bleacher building at Huntington Park. Proposed mural – The FMMF – “Fashion Meets Music Festival” . The Downtown Commission has previously approved numerous murals at this location, mostly related to Anheuser Busch products and Mt. Carmel Health CC3359.07(D).

**Dimensions of mural:** 16'W x 22'H Two dimensional, non lit

**Term of installation:** Seeking approval from May 28 through September 5, 2014.

**Area of mural:** 352 sf

**Approximate % of area that is text:** 5%

**Discussion**

The question is whether FMMF counts as text. If it does, it is 16%, if not, 5%. The mural is also smaller in area by almost half than many of the prior mural. Is the FMMF a logo? DP – it looks good. OB – it looks large. If we get criticized?

**Result**

Motion to approve. (5-0)

**Case #13b 813-14**

**Pepsi ad mural**

**330 Huntington Park Lane– South elevation of Left Field Bleacher Building**

**Applicant:** Ken Schnack, President, Columbus Clippers

**Property Owner:** Franklin County Board of Commissioners

**Design Professional:** DaNite Sign Co.

**Request:**

Design review and approval for installation of a heat transfer advertising mural to be located on the south elevation of the left field bleacher building at Huntington Park. Proposed mural – another Pepsi mural. The Downtown Commission has previously approved numerous murals at this location, the latest being another Pepsi ad mural. CC3359.07(D).

**Dimensions of mural:** 22'W x 26'H Two dimensional, non lit

**Term of installation:** Seeking approval from May 28 through September 5, 2014.

**Area of mural:** 572 sf

**Approximate % of area that is text:** 13%\*

**Discussion**

Calculation of text does not include “Pepsi”. JM – needs to be brought to standard. ML – the text is bold font. TH – reduce the text on top.

**Result**

Motion made to approve, provided that the applicant resubmit to staff with a reduction of text to 5%. (5-0)

**VIII. Business / Discussion****Public Forum**

Staff Certificates of Appropriateness have been issued since last meeting (Apr. 22, 2014)

1. 10 W. Broad – 2 wall signs – authorized by Commission
2. 10 W. Broad – 1 wall sign – authorized by Commission
3. 21 E. State St. – move Mr. Peanut
4. 296-306 (300) Marconi – Roofing
5. 44 - 44 E Chestnut- Parking Signs
6. A39-14 - 250 Civic Center - T Mobile Antenna
7. 20 E. Broad – Temp graphics for Farmers Market
8. 19 Gay – Graphics for ZenCha Tea
9. 1 Nationwide – Generator
10. Franklin County – Replace antenna
11. 195 Grant Ave – Ohio Guidestone signage
12. 80 Sixth – Bosco Banner
13. Apple – 285 N. Front St. – Orange Barrel
14. Apple – 80 E. Long St. – Orange Barrel
15. Apple – 43 W. Long St. – Orange Barrel
16. Apple - 15 W. Cherry St. – CBS Outdoor
17. Apple -35 W. Spring St. – Clear Channel

**If you have questions concerning this agenda, please contact Daniel Thomas, Urban Design Manager, Planning Division at 645-8404. 2:58**